

New Europe College Yearbook

2022-2023

Volume 2



YURI RADCHENKO
VLADIMIR RYZHKOVSKIY
ADRIAN SCHIFFBECK
BEATRICE SCUTARU
ALEXANDRA TEODOR
ALIAKSANDRA VALODZINA
ALEXANDRU VOLACU
MYROSLAV VOLOSHCHUK
MICHAŁ WASIUCIONEK

Editor: Andreea Eșanu

EDITORIAL BOARD

Dr. Dr. h.c. mult. Andrei PLEȘU, President of the New Europe Foundation, Professor of Philosophy of Religion, Bucharest; former Minister of Culture and former Minister of Foreign Affairs of Romania

Dr. Valentina SANDU-DEDIU, Rector, New Europe College, Bucharest, Professor of Musicology, National University of Music, Bucharest

Dr. Anca OROVEANU, Permanent Fellow, New Europe College, Bucharest; Professor of Art History, National University of Arts, Bucharest

Dr. Katharina BIEGGER, Strategic Advisor, Center for Governance and Culture in Europe, University of St. Gallen

Dr. Constantin ARDELEANU, Senior Researcher, Institute for South-East European History, Bucharest; Researcher, New Europe College, Bucharest

Dr. Irina VAINOVSKI-MIHAI, Professor of Arab Studies, “Dimitrie Cantemir” Christian University, Bucharest

Dr. Andreea EȘANU, (non-tenure) Assistant Professor, University of Bucharest, Faculty of Philosophy

Copyright – New Europe College, 2023

ISSN 1584-0298

New Europe College

Str. Plantelor 21

023971 Bucharest

Romania

www.nec.ro; e-mail: nec@nec.ro

Tel. (+4) 021.307.99.10



ALIAKSANDRA VALODZINA

Gerda Henkel Fellow

Born in 1989 in Belarus

Ph.D. in History, Belarusian State University (2018)

Thesis: "The Waldensian movement in the late 12th - early 15th centuries"

Independent researcher

Fellowships and research grants

Swiss Government Excellence Scholarship at the Faculty of Arts, University of Lausanne, Switzerland (2021-2022)

Program Stypendialny Rządu RP im. Konstatego Kalinowskiego – Program II at the Center for East European Studies, University of Warsaw, Poland (2020-2021)

Scholarships of the Belarusian State University for Bachelor and Master students, Minsk (2011, 2012, 2014)

Participation in international conferences in Belarus, Germany, Lithuania, Poland, Russia, Switzerland

Published research papers in refereed academic journals, book chapters,
working papers in Medieval History, Church history, and translations of
medieval sources from Latin to Belarusian

Tourist Guide

LABELLING THE WALDENSES: OTHERING A MEDIEVAL RELIGIOUS MOVEMENT

Aliaksandra Valodzina

Abstract

Over the past 850 years, the Waldensian religious movement has often been presented in the heretical narrative. The Waldenses were often seen as the embodiment of the very idea of heresy. Their image was othered in all possible ways to create the most terrifying impression: they were false saints, guilty of the sin of vainglory, Lucifer worshipers, and witches. They were spreading a heretical contagion around them, and they always turned back to their errors. The Waldensian magisters were imagined as cunning false prophets, scribes, and Pharisees, seducing silly weak peasants. The former were said to attract the latter with the “appearance of piety”, but in reality, they organize sexual orgies during their secret night gatherings. In the case of the Waldenses, shift of the image from modesty to promiscuity was especially necessary. The real Waldensian doctrine did not include any scandalous matters, such as human sacrifice that could automatically prevent most of the population from joining this sect. These modes of othering equate to the Waldenses becoming the pattern of heresy. In the XIV century, “heretics” and “The Waldenses” were near-synonyms. This amalgamation had very important consequences. First, they accumulate in themselves all the possible accusations of the heretics, and it hides their uniqueness beyond Catholic fantasies. Second, their name could be attributed to other dissident groups, which exaggerated the number of sectarians and imported foreign features to the Waldensian doctrine. Third, they could be used as a universal opponent in the inner Church polemic, replacing prelates – the real target of the accusations – with the aim of bringing attention to the problem.

At the same time, in their own narratives, the Waldenses were presented as martyrs for the true Church of Christ. This line was supported by the Protestants in the Modern Era.

As a typical religious dissident movement, the Waldenses occupy an important “place in memory” of modern scholars. Most large schools in historiography, including socio-economic history and gender studies, have the Waldensian movement in their sphere of interest, sometimes exaggerating their significance. All this “omnipresence” of medieval Waldensianism “seduces” scholars to dramatize the significance and dispersion of the movement, and,

what is less obvious but much more dangerous, to be less critical of works of their predecessors.

Modern historiography moved away from an interpretation of the Catholic medieval sources “from the contrary”, omitting all the insults and non-true statements. This paper proposes that the Waldensian women were more engaged in broad devout reading and teaching at home than in preaching to the mass audience. In parallel with early Christians, secret night gatherings could be understood as clandestine preaching meetings in situations of inquisitorial persecution. The Waldensians were forced to be tricky under interrogation, and their opponents exaggerated their educational level and homiletic abilities to shame contemptuous prelates.

The Waldensian movement is a throughline of the European religious dissident history through the centuries. Thanks to their presence on large territories and in different social strata, the Waldensian sources could provide data not only on the history of religion, but also on social history or microhistory, or the history of mentality. Cultural history could take into account their role as picture-perfect Other.

Keywords: Waldenses, heresy, religious polemic, othering, gender studies, Protestantism, witch-hunting, Luciferianism

1. Introduction

When studying historical sources and sometimes even historiography, a scholar encounters several basic questions: why did the author write it? Establishing the purpose of the author makes it possible to approach the source more critically: did the author deliberately distort the facts in order to present their point of view or to align with a certain historiographical tradition? It happened many times with medieval heretics when their Catholic opponents wrote offensive treatises against them. Since the beginning of the Modern Era, there have been different non-religious explanations of heresy. As one of the best specialists in the field of medieval religious movements, Peter Biller, said: “Flacius gave to heresies a Protestant mask, Engels revolutionary, Rosenberg Nazi, Koch feminist, – and by the 1970s their latest, ‘popular cultural’, mask was taking shape”.¹

During my studies, I discovered that the Waldensian movement fits every possible image of heresy. In this article, the main patterns of the heretical narrative will be analyzed, with the focus on the role and place of the Waldensian movement in the debates. The very word “Waldensian” becomes a synonym of “heretic”. If for the 13th century “heretic” is, most

likely, a Cathar, then for the 14th century, – this is a Waldensian.² The first part of the research paper will investigate the place of the Waldenses in the complex medieval image made not only of heretics, witches, and devil worshipers but also as a euphemism for an intra-Church polemic. Guy Lobrichon suggested a metaphorical reading of medieval texts, treating them as coded documents.³ At the same time, as it will be shown below, the approach of Leslie Lockett is also fruitful: sometimes a modern reader sees a metaphor where there is none.⁴ It is safe to assume that some even highly offensive descriptions of the heretics were based not only on insulting analogies but had real reasons, interpreted poorly by Catholic authors, or were direct retellings of the case without any pejorative connotation.

This omnipresence concerns not only medieval sources but also historiography. The Waldensian religious movement was an essential part of the Protestant historical narrative. This led to the methodology, used by Grażyna Szwał-Gyłybowa in her book *Haeresis bulgarica w bułgarskiej świadomości kulturowej XIX i XX wieku*. She researches the “place of memory” of the Bogomils in the Bulgarian mentality.⁵ Szwał-Gyłybowa shows the design of an image of a Bulgarian heretic as an ancestor of European religious reforms, rationalism, Enlightenment humanism, and even a New Age.⁶ Sometimes it coincides with the image of a Waldensian – a high-moral miserable persecuted predecessor of the Protestants. The second part of the article will deal with the interpretation of the Waldenses in class theory and gender studies as well as the correlation of their results with recent research.

Not all movements considered heretical by the Roman Catholic Church felt opposed to it from the beginning. The movements of the *devotio moderna*⁷ or *vita apostolica*⁸ were born within society and crystallized their doctrine at the same time as their opposition to the Apostolic See grew. “The confrontation of the self with non-self constitutes identity”,⁹ in other words – in controversy with the ecclesiastical authorities they developed their doctrine. Even the Cathar doctrine, for a long time considered external and extremely hostile to the Apostolic See, can be seen today as “profound evangelism, which did not want to separate from the Church”.¹⁰ Mark Gregory Pegg, one of the leaders of the new vision of the Cathars, claimed that “What transformed these individuals into heretics, what turned the accusation into actuality, was the violence of the Albigensian Crusade and the persecution of the early inquisitors”.¹¹ It were polemical treatises that transformed Cathars’ scattered beliefs

into a coherent doctrine.¹² And it was the Roman Catholic Church that made heresies. The same is true for the Church itself – the war on heresy leads to the unity of the official clergy.¹³ Ryan Szpiech asserts that “an affirmation of the core mythology of one is an implicit rejection of other, rival historical models, and a representation of the movement between such paradigms is likewise both a profession of faith and a repudiation of difference according to an exclusive historical model”.¹⁴

The Waldenses follow the same path.¹⁵ This medieval religious movement was started around 1170 in Lyon by its wealthy citizen Waldo. He was very close to the archbishop of Lyon at the time, Guichard of Pontigny († 1181) and shared with him some ideas on how to improve the morale of the clergy.¹⁶ Near 1174 he had given up his property and had started to preach the Gospels. Subsequently, with some of his followers, Waldo presented to the Pope the translation of the Bible in the “vulgar” language at the III Lateran Council in Rome in 1179. In 1180, he made a full-Catholic confession of faith. By contrast, only two years later, when a new archbishop of Lyon John of Canterbury (French *Jean Belles-Mains*, † 1204) forbade the Waldenses to preach, Waldo refused to obey him and, consequently, the Roman Catholic Church.¹⁷ After two more years, the Waldenses were called “schismatics”. The Pope condemned them as heretics (which is worse than schismatics) in the middle of the 13th century. On the contrary, the “heretics” themselves would think they were a part of the official Church since the beginning. The process of the separation lasted more than two centuries.

Some of the Waldenses chose to turn back to the unity of the Roman Catholic Church. Nevertheless, a major part of the Waldenses remained in opposition to the Roman Papacy and crystallized in a strong but a heterogenous heretical movement. They denied the existence of Purgatory, the efficiency of indulgences, holy water, and in general all Church rituals. Furthermore, they rejected oaths as sinful. The Waldensian believers confessed their sins to the “masters” of their sect and not to Catholic priests. At their height, in the 14th century, the Waldenses had several extensive networks of regional communities from the Pyrenees to Western Pomerania, connected by wandering preachers. Moreover, the Waldenses formed a unique medieval dissenting movement that was transformed into a part of the Protestant Church, with the center near Turin and in Latin America.

2. The Waldenses in medieval sources

2.1. A polemical model

In general, the accusation of heretics was based on a standard template. Lucy Sackville, in her major work *Heresies and Heretics*, summarized the most frequent polemical techniques used by Catholic authors to attack their opponents (her study was later supplemented by Emmanuel Bain).¹⁸ Almut Suerbaum shows “the linguistic strategies they use to undermine, belittle and at times endanger an opponent, assessing the extent to which they [sermons – A.V.] use language as a means of attack”.¹⁹ Here, these techniques and strategies are discussed in the anti-Waldensian narrative.

Some of these techniques are direct insults. It is about, first and foremost, the comparison with dogs that go back to their vomit.²⁰ “But, returning to [his] vomit, he [Waldo] did not stop gathering and sending out disciples”.²¹ In most cases, this expression applied to relapsed heretics.

There were shameful euphemisms for heresies. First, it was an allegorical comparison to little foxes – an allusion to Song of Solomon 2:15.²² “These foxes go forth to waste the Lord’s vineyard, pitiful and utterly shameful persons, they have usurped the work of preaching, wholly or nearly illiterate, or rather non-spiritual”.²³

Much more frequent was the comparison of the heretical danger to poison and infection:²⁴

“And there is great danger that this sect will be overextended to include many Catholics of both sexes, who will be tempted to apostatize from the Catholic faith and be fatally infected with the heretical poison unless a Christian army stands in their way”.²⁵

Turning back to the theory of embodiment of feelings, the comparison of heretics with diseases could be more than a metaphor: they are believed to be “dead inside”.²⁶ The very body of heretics changes physically under the influence of their impious beliefs. For the medieval writers, Jews, Muslims, and heretics belonged to the same kind, even from a “corporal” point of view: they all had “the primordial passions, which disturb the peace of the holy”.²⁷ This question was deeply studied by Reima Välimäki.²⁸ Here, more important is not the cause, but the aim of such a pattern.

The metaphor of the human body and its diseases exists nowadays. Critical discourse analysis of this metaphor, made by Andreas Musolff,

showed that “just as it is imperative for a successful medical therapy to eliminate all agents of disease in case of a serious illness, so any socio-political elements of the nation that threaten its existence have to be eliminated.”²⁹ The labeling of the heretics as a disease legitimizes violence against them.

In the quoted example, the aim of the author seems to be almost the same: to show how wrong and dangerous heretics are. Grado Giovanni Merlo demonstrated that coercion to the Orthodoxy (namely the Catholic faith) goes through the creation of scary images of heretics.³⁰ With the Waldenses, such changing of the image was especially necessary. The real Waldensian doctrine did not include any scandalous matters, such as human sacrifice, that could automatically prevent the majority of the population from joining this sect. On the contrary, their life was the perfect following of the Gospels’ orders. An anonymous cleric, a Dominican monk or a catholic priest, wrote ca. 1260 in the diocese of Passau:

“Among all the sects that are or have been, there is no one more destructive to the church of God than the Leonists,³¹ and for three reasons: [...] Thirdly, because, while all the others with monstrous blasphemies of God bring horror to those who hear God, these Leonists, having a great appearance of piety – by the fact that they live righteously before men and believe properly in everything about God and all the articles that are contained in the symbol – only they blaspheme the Roman Church and the clergy, whom the multitude of the laity can easily believe”.³²

Here is a concept of *species pietatis* – “appearance of piety”. It means that heretics with high moral qualities were presented as hypocritical ones allegedly dissolute inside. There was a contrast between the external purity of a heretic and his/her internal evil. This *species pietatis* is a tool used by heretics to seduce miserable believers with their fake outer piety.³³

Such a polemical thesis enabled the clergy to accuse any person regardless of his/her behavior.

According to the clergy, there are two awful crimes that heretics could do secretly: orgies and preaching.

Heretics were described as morally weak, promiscuous, and indulging in sexual orgies in the dark.³⁴ For the first time, such accusations were used in the 2nd century against Christians themselves,³⁵ and from the 4th, this weapon was turned against Christian dissidents. It was St. Epiphanius of Salamis († 403) who described a Christian sect in which members not only

practiced promiscuity in the night but also consumed children conceived at these gatherings.³⁶

The Waldenses were blamed for nocturnal debauchery too:

[About what happens in a *synagogue*³⁷] “They eat and drink with great joy, starting when the peoples of the earth go to sleep, after drinking and eating they put out the light, saying: who has, holds,³⁸ and those men and women next step they hug each other and stay like that until dawn”.³⁹

During the 11th and 12th centuries, heretics were also blamed for child sacrifice and cannibalism. Ademar of Chabannes († around 1034) claims that a peasant-heresiarch had with him ashes of dead⁴⁰ children, which functioned as a magic powder: everybody, who took it occasionally with food or drink, became a heretic and could not resist a heresiarch.⁴¹ In the first centuries of the Waldensian movement, these accusations disappeared, only to return later during the witch-hunting of the Late Middle Ages.

The absence of gossip about this immoral behavior was tried to explain by the secret character of this part of the doctrine. Heretics operate in secret (even when they preach publicly).⁴² “They preach in secret and private places”.⁴³ The switch to secret preaching was made in the circumstances of growing inquisitorial persecution at the beginning of the 14th century. The most famous “inquisitor of heretical depravity” of Toulouse Bernard Gui († around 1331) mentioned the existence of “strangers” who should not be present at the Waldensian rites for security reasons.⁴⁴ The same attitude was registered in 1335 on the other side of the Alps.⁴⁵ Since the real Church of Christ should preach openly “under the light” (Matthew 10:27), all who preach secretly were seen as heretics.

The arrival of such heretics was announced in the Bible (2 Peter 2:1, 1 Timothy 4:1, Revelation 13:1): heretics, including the Waldenses, are false prophets.⁴⁶ This accusation was reciprocal: the Waldenses named the Catholic prelates *Judei prophetas, et scribe et pharisei*.⁴⁷ It shows that both the catholic clergy and the heretics had the same cultural Christian background and operated the same *topoi* for offending their opponents.

Apparently, not all heretics were prophets: the Church separated a “clerical core” from common believers. This core was imagined in contrast with the Catholic clergy which had knowledge from God. The heretical preachers used not the real sacral doctrine, but cunning tricks. Sophistic leaders stand out among the naive, deceived believers of heresiarchs.⁴⁸

“When they first turned to ordinary people, because they avoided crafty and learned people, they said that they knew the best prayers”.⁴⁹

The reason for the spread of heresy was seen not only in the laziness of the Catholic clergy but also in their incapacity to confront heresiarchs. “Often the rhetorical skills of those who hold heretical views are considered superior to those of Christians, and they therefore expose the listeners to the danger of being misled”.⁵⁰ “Let the negligence of the faithful doctors⁵¹ be shamed, who are not so zealous for the truth of the Catholic faith, as the perfidious Leonists are zealous for the error of unbelief”.⁵²

An external sign of the heretical Church not being the Church of Christ was that the heretics are divided and at war with each other, but the true Church must be united.⁵³ “The Waldensian doctors, who in their errors and opinions are divided into three groups, and, as a result, cannot create a church, because the church is united in faith, as it is said by Ephesians 4”.⁵⁴

At the same time, a historian who understands this polemical model cannot discard the data as completely fictional. Heated debates continue around the issue of nocturnal orgies.⁵⁵ Regarding the early Christian accusation of the 2nd century, we know that it stemmed from the misunderstanding of concepts of *brotherly love* and *the kiss of peace*.⁵⁶ Without dipping into victim blaming of the Waldenses, it would be useful to work on the question of what was hidden beyond such an accusation.

The issue of the inner division of the movement was proved by a source written by the Waldenses themselves. In 1218, there was a meeting in Bergamo between the so-called *Ultramontani* (French branch) and *Ytalici* (Lombardian branch).⁵⁷ Later, this division was discussed in several types of Catholic sources, but the presence of the original document proved its reality.

The information about heretical cunning could not be regarded as only offensive. As was noticed by John Arnold, “A man takes an ox by the horn and a peasant by the tongue”.⁵⁸ Inquisitors mastered the art of interrogation. These protocols became the main source of further accusations and persecutions. In such a situation, the skill of answering the inquisitors’ questions was crucial for surviving. “They resort to sophisms, hypocrisies, and evasions in words to avoid being exposed in their errors”.⁵⁹ Several instructions for the right response to the inquisitorial questionnaire are preserved. They could be found in the Anonymous of Passau,⁶⁰ David of Augsburg († 1272),⁶¹ Bohemian Kingdom around 1330.⁶² The latter source contains the most illustrative story of the Waldensian legend invented to deceive an Inquisitor:

“When you are asked if people come to you who hear confessions and deliver sermons, answer: ‘Some men came to us who [omitted by the editor] to us, and carry other household things necessary for women’. And this way, they escaped imprisonment and deceived the office of investigation so that none of them was cremated”.⁶³

All the listed characteristics are found in the works describing the Waldenses. In addition to the analysis of each of them, one more research question could be asked: Were the Waldenses such a universal heretical movement to have all the typical (in the eyes of a Catholic polemicist) heretical features? Or was this standard set planted by outside authors, mostly Catholic monks?

2.2. A universal opponent

Reima Välimäki proposed the third possible solution: the refutation of the “Waldensian errors” was just a convenient tool for demonstrating the correctness of one’s own opinion during intra-Church polemics. He claims that “inquisitors tried to brand their opponent as a Waldensian, even when they almost certainly knew that the accused was not a proper Waldensian, but a clergyman like themselves”.⁶⁴

This could explain the fact that by the end of the same century, the number of Waldenses in Europe was gradually decreasing, primarily due to the intensification of inquisitorial persecution, but the number of polemical works against the Waldenses was increasing.⁶⁵ The point at issue is that sometimes when there is the name “the Waldenses” in a source, its author would like to talk in reality not about them or about any other heresy, but about an internal Church problem. The Waldenses here serve as a metaphor for great sinners. “At that point, the unanswerable quality of this polemic became supremely evident: no case could be made for Jews, infidels or heretics”.⁶⁶ As mentioned above, the Church of God should be united. This very fact often prevented clerics from repeating the accusation of heretics in an attempt to point to the errors of fellow prelates. “Whereas direct polemical attack serves to undermine the opponent, attacks against a fictional sinner in singular use a strategy of misplaced invective – direct in its linguistic attack, yet distanced in order not to alienate the listeners.”⁶⁷ In this case, prelates – the real target of the accusations – were replaced by heretics with the aim of attracting attention to the problem and punish the culprits with maximum severity.

The coincidence of the development of this or that element of Catholic doctrine and the persistence with which the inquisitors inquired about it can be traced. It has been established that the Catholic polemic was “a way of affirming Christian identity by contrasting it aggressively with heretical forms of belief”.⁶⁸ Katrin Utz Tremp shows the dependence between the opposition of the Waldenses to the church and the establishment of some dogma in it. According to her, the decrease in the refusal of the Waldensian oaths is related to the shifting of the attention to purgatory and to the Marian cult, which the Waldenses at the peak of the church began to challenge more decisively.⁶⁹ It is necessary to note that the position of the Catholic Church in this case somewhat influenced the opinions of the inquisitors and the authors of polemical treatises, through whose “lens” the medieval Waldenses are being watched today. The procedure of the inquisitorial trial was built more on the active role of the inquisitor himself, who had template questionnaires.⁷⁰ Cases where an accused said more than was asked, were comparatively rare. This finding aligns with the data about heretical doctrine being more contingent on what an inquisitor asked rather than what the defendant really believed.

2.3. Waldo as a false saint

One of the ways to alienate an opponent is to add to their portrait a small detail that changes and desacralizes the whole perception one can have of them. The conversion of Waldo into the “true” faith was modelled in the Chronicle of Laon (France, 13th century) after the standard medieval life of a saint but with mocking details:

“On a certain Sunday, when he [Waldo] turned to the crowd, which he had seen gathered around a juggler (*joculator*), he was shocked by his words, and he invited him to his house, and made an effort to listen to him carefully. That was the part of his story, where Saint Alexis found blessed peace in his father’s house”.⁷¹

Francesca Tasca points out that despite all the outwardly positive description of Waldo’s first steps, there is “a red flag”: the reason for the appeal was not a sermon in the temple, but the story of a juggler-buffoon in the square. She suggests that this was emphasized specifically to neutralize its sacred significance.⁷² The reliability of the story about the life of St. Alexis has long been the subject of scholarly debate.⁷³ The paper by Tasca

raises another discussion point: is the very fact of *joculator* as the initiator of the Waldo's conversion humiliating?

Apart from a later image of St. Francis of Assisi († 1226) as the “juggler of God”, there were other earlier examples. Not long before Waldo, there was another man near Laon, Aybert of Crespin (also known as Aibert of Tournai, † 1140), who changed his life due to a juggler. This fact did not prevent him from becoming a Catholic saint.⁷⁴

St. Bernard of Clairvaux († 1153), a famous and influential Catholic author, also described jugglers' performances as “pleasant, respectable, serious, attractive, that can delight the looks of celestial spectators”.⁷⁵ King David himself is treated by Bernard as “playing in the face of God”.⁷⁶ Here, real jugglers perform as the metaphorical opposition to “jugglers of God”.⁷⁷ Using the scheme proposed by Tasca that the description of the Waldo's public speech was a mirror to the jugglers, it is possible to assume that Waldo could play the role not of a terrestrial, but a celestial juggler. This “mirror” could be traced also in the comparison of jugglers and public penitents.⁷⁸ Waldo's first act after his conversion, the distribution of his possessions as alms, is essentially a public penance for former wealth.

2.4. Devil worship

From the Late Middle Ages, interest in the contact between a man and the devil began to grow throughout Europe. As Herbert Grundmann, a well-known specialist in Medieval religious movements, noted:

“Judges of heresy and moralists of the worst sort, however, easily stoked ordinary people's horror of night-time underground gatherings of men and women into incredible fantasies». This fantasy was ‘Luciferan’ heresy, a belief in a diabolical sect that worshipped Satan or demons in night-time orgies that included incest and child-murder. «Scholars following him [Herbert Grundmann] have convincingly deconstructed the sect of Luciferans as a clerical fantasy and imagined heresy – often precisely against Waldensians»”.⁷⁹

Such evidence appeared in the records of Waldensian interrogations, for example, in 1315 in Schweidnitz (today Polish Świdnica near Wrocław) and at the same time in the Austrian Krems:

“And it seems to them that everything around becomes gold, and the heavens appear before them, and a golden throne, and Lucifer in supreme power, and angels fly around; and from that moment they are servants of Lucifer”.⁸⁰

At the same time, other authors, including such experienced inquisitors as Bernard Gui⁸¹ or polemist David of Augsburg,⁸² rejected these accusations. There are two possibilities here: either the worship of Lucifer was a regional feature of Waldensianism (which is unlikely), or the local inquisitors were influenced by anti-devil hysteria, confusing the Waldenses with the Cathars (who, as dualists, were accused of worshipping Lucifer/Devil/evil god, the creator of all material things). The data do not seem to be planted into the protocols, and the subject of devil adoration is absent from this trial’s questionnaire.⁸³ Since this information is scattered and rejected in other contemporary sources, it can be assumed that the inquisitors forced the accused (under torture or trickery) to confess their connection with hellish forces. The issue of Luciferianism of the Waldenses was deeply discussed by Jarosław Szymański⁸⁴ and Magdalena Ogórek,⁸⁵ who hold opposite views.

A stereotyped description of the adoration of Lucifer was also used in the allegations against the Waldenses. The Devil comes to his slaves as a goat, a monkey, or, most often, a cat. They kneel down before the beast and kiss him “at the opposite side”. This process could be seen in the illustration of *Sermo contra sectam Vaudensium* by Johann Tinctor († 1469)⁸⁶. Sometimes Satan set his servants – demons – in the form of animals: “And another demon who was worshiped in the form of a cat, who is called Temon, and also another who was worshiped in the form of a goat.”⁸⁷ Initially, this *topos* had been used with regards to the Cathars⁸⁸ but following the extermination of this movement, it was extended to the Waldenses and witches as well.

2.5. Witches on broomsticks

At the end of the Middle Ages, the popularity of the heretical *topos* in Western Europe started to fall, but the “witch-hunting” began to grow.

The Waldensian texts contain one of the first descriptions of the Sabbath in Europe (trial in Pinerolo near Turin, 1387-88).

“She [woman – leader of the regional branch of the sect] kept a large toad under the bed, which she fed with meat and bread and cheese. When he [the inquisitor] was asked why she was keeping it, he answered, that she might make the aforesaid potion [which they drink during the Sabbath] out of its excrements.”⁸⁹

Starting from the early 15th century, there had been many rumors about a new sect in the Alpine region. Its members were mostly women (witches) flying on brooms. Inquisitor Claude of Toulouse, who had been waging anti-witchcraft campaign in Savoy since 1428, wrote about the origin of this sect “from Lyon” (not directly mentioning the Waldenses, but recalling that one of their names was “poor of Lyon”, Waldo’s hometown).

In 1429-1430, a large inquisitorial process in Fribourg in Switzerland was conducted by the Dominican inquisitor Ulrich von Torrenté from Lausanne. There are no records of the persecutions in 1429; only the treasurer’s accounts of the city of Fribourg were preserved. The accounts are written in French and here the prisoners are referred to as *vaudois* and their crimes as *vaudoisie*. These terms had an initial translation “Waldensens” and “Waldensianism”, but then the meaning “sorcerers, witches” and “sorcery, witchcraft” was added. The problem is that it is impossible to establish an exact moment in time when “Waldensianism” started to mean “sorcery, witchcraft”.⁹⁰ During the next process, in 1437, by the term *vaudoises* they certainly understood “sorcerers, witches”.

Mixing of the *topoi* of the Waldenses and witches was studied by Franck Mercier and Martine Ostorero.⁹¹ The process could be summarized in the next table:

Year	Place	Case
1315	Krems and Schweidnitz	the Waldenses worship Lucifer
1388	Alpine Valleys	the Waldenses organize Shabbat with sexual orgy and witch potion
1427	Alpine Valleys	inhabitants practice magic
1428	Alpine Valleys	the sect of broom-flyers is of Lyonnais origin
1428	Alpine Valleys	<i>gazzart</i> = Waldensian
1430	Fribourg	<i>vaudoises</i> = both the Waldenses and witches

Year	Place	Case
1440	Alpine Valleys	the Waldenses = witches
1447	Fribourg	<i>vaudoises</i> = witches
1449	Alpine Valleys	Waldensian lohaneta is a witch flying on a broom
1451	Lyon and Savoy	women flying on brooms signed as <i>les vaudoises</i> on a margin (first such picture in the history) ⁹²
1460	Arras	the Waldenses = witches

It is important to note that once again the Waldenses were in the spotlight of Western European religious history. No scholar asserts that they really practiced witchcraft; Wolfgang Behringer in his article *How Waldensians Became Witches: Heretics and Their Journey to the Other World*, shows the features of their daily life and doctrine that could lead to such conclusions.⁹³

Thus, according to the Catholic narrative, during the Middle Ages, the Waldenses accumulated all the possible negative features of heretics. Sometimes the Waldenses personified an enemy, “the other”. In other situations, their imaginary negative qualities were exaggerated to emphasize the danger and make the Roman Catholic Church purify itself and unite.

3. The Waldenses in Historiography

Modern historiography has not lost its interest in the Waldenses. Considering the previous bias of the medieval Catholic authors, first Protestant scholars created an opposite, extremely positive image of a Waldensian, similar to the one of a Bogomil in the Bulgarian national narrative.

Later historiography used them as an example for different theories, such as Marxism. Due to the lack of data, as often happens with Medieval Studies, it led to improper conclusions. The Waldenses have become a rhetorical device yet again, when their importance has been exaggerated to make a point in the research.

3.1. Predecessors of the Protestants

The situation with the perception of the Waldenses changed with the beginning of the Reformation: for the first time, they were positively marked by authors outside the sect.

The first Protestant preachers began to actively search for their predecessors in history, those who would carry “the fire of true faith in the darkness of the Middle Ages”, and found them in the same Waldenses,⁹⁴ emphasizing common points in teaching and ignoring differences.⁹⁵ The piquancy of the situation is that it was the Catholics who invented the idea of the Protestants as the descendants of the Medieval heresies⁹⁶ (an offensive idea from the Catholic point of view).

After realizing their mistake, the Catholics offered another version of the roots of Waldensianism. They started to talk about Waldo as an “unrealized St. Francis of Assisi”⁹⁷ or St. Dominic.⁹⁸ Indeed, there is much in common between the original ideology and statutes of the Franciscans, Dominicans, and early groups of the Waldenses who turned back to Roman Catholic Church (the “Poor Catholics” and the “Reconciled Poor”).⁹⁹ All groups emerged at about the same time and under the same circumstances. Later, these ex-Waldenses groups (together with their collective property) became members of the Catholic monastic orders. This gives the reason to some authors – supporters of the Roman Church – to underestimate the importance of the heretical component of the teaching of the first Waldenses, focusing exclusively on factors common to them and Catholics. In addition, as the latest studies show, the medieval Waldenses did not share the fundamental Protestant concept of “salvation by faith”.¹⁰⁰

It could be concluded here that the medieval Waldenses were neither “proto-Protestants” nor Catholics, but an independent religious movement that was born inside the Catholic Church, and left it for a number of reasons.

3.2. Class Theory against statistical and computer analysis

There is no consensus about the social structure of the Waldensian movement. Existing scarce data are highly controversial, the same as the opinions of scholars.¹⁰¹ The most radical statement belongs to Friedrich Engels, who used the Waldenses to illustrate his class theory. He described this movement as the reaction of patriarchal alpine shepherds to the penetration of feudalism.¹⁰² This approach effectively eliminated the

possibility of studying Waldensianism in the territory of the Soviet Union. Even though the social element in the religious movements of the High Middle Ages could not be discarded,¹⁰³ its superiority was not proved.

The publication of numerous sources enabled various types of quantitative analysis, which revealed new trends and facts. The severity of punishment (the number of burned convicts) was discovered to be lower.¹⁰⁴ One of the best examples is the work of Jean-Paul Rehr, devoted to the inquisitorial protocols of 1245-1246.¹⁰⁵ The main conclusion that the author makes is that the inquisitors were not really interested in exposing heresy and finding all possible heretics, but in constructing an accusation against narrow circles of influential families. For example, when answering a typical inquisitorial question “who else was involved in this?” after listing a few interesting names, they were satisfied with the phrase “and others”, instead of interviewing everyone in detail and writing down all the data.¹⁰⁶ Everything points to the conclusion that this process was politically arranged. The reasons for such an order are currently unknown, but the very fact of its finding changes the view of the credibility of the data we receive from this type of sources. In this example, the sources from the Languedoc show us a relatively high status of the accused. However, it is unclear if there were no poor Waldenses or if they were not mentioned because the inquisitors tried to accuse only some rich families and did not care about others.

3.3. Gender issues

The Waldenses were not left out of gender studies: the relationship between women and the Bible in the Middle Ages is studied often on the basis of data about the Waldenses.¹⁰⁷ The female role in the movement became the subject of many papers and was always presented as quite high because, at an early stage, women were also allowed to preach among the Waldenses.¹⁰⁸ In contemporary Latin sources, the Waldensian women preachers are called “poor women” (*mulieres pauperes*) or “silly women” (*mulierculae*). Biblical scholars see this as an opposition to teaching among women in the early Church.¹⁰⁹ These *mulierculae* are actually mentioned in every early work.¹¹⁰ However, the opponents of the Waldenses argued that the latter allowed women not to preach, but rather to seduce, as Eve seduced Adam.¹¹¹ It is safe to presume that this is related to the fact that silent Blessed Mary was ideal for Catholic polemicists. Over time, women preachers disappear from the pages of historical sources.

However, the very role of women in the early Waldensian movement started to be reconsidered in the latest papers. Thanks to the new research on inquisitorial protocols, we know that the number of women was lower than commonly believed.¹¹²

The image of a woman-preacher seems to have to be reconsidered as well. It is noteworthy that Waldensian sources are silent about this female duty; it means that there is no information about how the Waldenses justified women's right to preach, or whether it was equal to men's in their eyes. Perhaps, within the community, the role of a woman was initially classified as more auxiliary. In Latin, there are terms such as actually preaching (*praedicare*), encouraging (*exhortare*), or giving advice (*admonere*). It is possible to translate all three as "preach", but in the Middle Ages, the first one had a much stronger religious load and was rather perceived as "reserved" for specially authorized persons, while the other two could be allowed for others as well. In his "statute", Durand of Osca (highly educated cleric and founder of ex-Waldensian communities "Poor Catholics") used *exhortare* to describe their intentions to preach.¹¹³ In his defense of secular preaching, Peter Chantor († 1197) also uses *exhortare* and *admonere*.¹¹⁴ Catholic authors choose *praedicare* in their accusations against the Waldenses. This allows to hypothesize that the Waldenses did not necessarily allow their women to preach in the most radical sense of the word; they were more involved in intellectual charity work. For example, there is trustworthy evidence about a woman who read the Gospel of John to a sick female friend.¹¹⁵ Catholic polemicists, while using the first term, tried to emphasize the scale of the heretical problem and intensify their attacks.

4. Reasons

Such "ubiquity" of the Waldensian "heresy" has different reasons. First, the Waldenses, unlike the Hussites or the Dulcinians, were not a local phenomenon. In the period of its greatest prosperity, the Waldensian itinerant preacher could be found over a wide area, from Stettin on the Baltic coast to Tarragona in Spain. Thus, they were a global pan-European problem for the papacy, local authorities, and the Inquisition. Secondly, accordingly, the Waldenses were actively written about – many sources have come down to nowadays, created both by the Waldenses and their opponents.

Thirdly, modern researchers do not doubt the very fact of the existence of the Waldenses. Not only the aforementioned Luciferianism but also the “Heresy of a Free Spirit” are proven to be an invention of the Medieval inquisitors. There is a great discussion around the Cathars. It means such movements could not be regarded as a universal example anymore, and the Waldenses have taken their place.

Finally, the Waldenses (as part of the Protestant Church) exist now. They have their own historians, museums, publishing house, and even a High School (Facoltà Valdese di Teologia di Roma).¹¹⁶

All of the above makes the Waldenses one of the most popular medieval heretical movements among both medieval authors and today’s scholars. Moreover, it makes the Waldensian movement not only yet another European medieval religious movement but a universal *topos* of “the other”.

5. Conclusions

Over the past 850 years, the Waldenses have often been presented in the heretical narrative. This movement has been the embodiment of the very idea of heresy. The Catholic Church used all available tools against it: from the incorporation of the proto-monastical communities (the “Poor Catholics” and the “Reconciled Poor”) to the crusades. Their image was othured in all possible ways to create the most terrifying impression: they were false saints, guilty of the sin of vainglory, Lucifer worshipers, and witches. Dead inside, they were spreading a heretical contagion around them, and even if the Roman Church made repent – they turned back to their errors as a dog returns to its vomit. The Waldensian magisters were cunning false prophets, scribes, and Pharisees, seducing silly weak peasants. The former attracted the latter with the “appearance of piety”, but in reality, they organize sexual orgies during their secret night gatherings. Nevertheless, the Roman Catholic plans to win this battle because it is united and preaches openly, as a real Church of God, and because it has real divine knowledge, whereas heretics pervert the Scripture, hiding in dens and are divided. This image of the ultimate evil was used by the clerics to debate inner Church issues, naming their opponents “Waldensians”. It equates to the Waldenses becoming stereotyped heretics. This amalgamation had very important consequences. First, they accumulate in themselves all the possible accusations of the heretics, and it hides

their uniqueness beyond Catholic fantasies. Second, their name could be attributed to other people, which exaggerated the number of sectarians, and imported foreign, but not so obviously false as open insults, features to the Waldensian doctrine.

At the same time, in their own narratives, the Waldenses were presented as martyrs for the true Church of Christ. This line was supported by the Protestants in the Modern Era.

The Waldenses as a typical religious dissident movement continue to occupy an important “place in memory” of modern scholars. Most large schools in historiography, including socio-economic history and gender studies, have the Waldensian movement within their purview, sometimes exaggerating their significance. All this “omnipresence” of medieval Waldensianism “seduces” scholars to dramatize the significance and dispersion of the movement, and, what is less obvious but much more dangerous, to be less critical of works of their predecessors.

Thus, as it was shown in the example of the Waldensian women, it is never enough to interpret the Catholic medieval sources “from the contrary”, omitting all the insults and non-true statements.¹¹⁷ Even the choice of the Latin word *exhortare* instead of *praedicare* could lead to the conclusion that the Waldensian women were rather more occupied by wide devout reading and teaching at home than preaching to the mass audience.

Other insulting accusations should be reinterpreted as well. In parallel with early Christians, secret night gatherings could be understood as clandestine preaching meetings in situations of inquisitorial persecution. The Waldensians were forced to be tricky under interrogation, and their opponents exaggerated their educational level and homiletic abilities to shame contemptuous prelates.

The Waldensian movement is a throughline of the European religious dissident history through the centuries. Thanks to their presence on large territories and in different social strata, the Waldensian sources could provide data not only on the history of religion, but also on social history or microhistory, or the history of mentality. Cultural history could consider their role as picture-perfect Other.

NOTES

- 1 BILLER 1996, 17.
- 2 MERLO 1974, 3.
- 3 LOBRICHON, 86.
- 4 LOCKETT 2011.
- 5 SZWAT-GYŁYBOWA, 18.
- 6 SZWAT-GYŁYBOWA, 292.
- 7 A movement for religious reform, calling for apostolic renewal through the rediscovery of genuine pious practices such as humility, obedience, and simplicity of life.
- 8 Imitation of the primitive church, poor, simple, and penitential, with interests and activities restricted to the spiritual domain; a passionate love for souls at home and far afield; and evangelical poverty in common, either predicated on mendicancy or mitigated by the work of one's own hands.
- 9 CLASSEN xi.
- 10 BIGET, 266.
- 11 PEGG, 38.
- 12 MANSELLI, 333.
- 13 REGIEWICZ, 45.
- 14 SZPIECH, 219.
- 15 The most comprehensive study of the history of the Medieval Waldenses as of 2023 is BENEDETTI and CAMERON 2022. It also contains the most detailed historiography of the issue.
- 16 For more details see RUBELLIN 2003.
- 17 PATSCHOVSKY 1973, 17.
- 18 BAIN.
- 19 SUERBAUM, 143.
- 20 SACKVILLE, 155. An allusion to 2 Peter 2:22.
- 21 "Sed reversus ad vomitum colligere et disseminare discipulos non desistit". GONNET 1958, 46.
- 22 BAIN, 61. Appears already in Irenaeus of Lyons († 202) *Adversus Haereses* 8, 1, who wrote a large work against the Gnostics and Marcion.
- 23 "Ad demoliendam vineam Domini vulpeculae prodierunt, personae contemptibiles et prorsus indignae, praedicationes officium usurpantes, sed potius sine spiritu". GONNET 1958, 46.
- 24 BAIN, 63; KIENZLE 1998, 270-272; VÄLIMÄKI 2016.
- 25 "Et timendum nimis est sectam illam valde dilatari plurimosque catholicos utriusque sexus ab orthodoxa fide abduci et ab haeticorum veneno letaliter infici, nisi eis obstitum fuerit ex acie christiana". DÖLLINGER, 305-306.
- 26 KRAMER, 127.
- 27 AKBARI 2009, p. 40.

- 28 VÄLIMÄKI 2016.
 29 MUSOLFF, 303.
 30 MERLO 2008, 23.
 31 One of Catholic names for the Waldenses.
 32 “Inter quas omnes sectas, que sunt vel fuerunt, non est perniciosior ecclesie
 dei quam Leonistarum, et tribus de causis: [...] Tercia quia, cum omnes alie
 immanitate blasphemiarum in deum audientibus horrorem inducant, hec
 Leonistarum magnam habens speciem pietatis – eo quod coram hominibus
 iuste vivant et bene omnia de deo credant et omnes articulos, qui in symbolo
 continentur – solummodo Romanam ecclesiam blasphemant et clerum, cui
 multitudo laicorum facilis est ad credendum”. PATSCHOVSKY 1973, 73.
 33 VÄLIMÄKI 2022, 33-35.
 34 SACKVILLE, 57.
 35 WAGEMAKERS, 338-339.
 36 WAGEMAKERS, 345.
 37 The name “synagogue” for a place of gathering of heretics and devil
 worshipers was taken from the Bible, Revelation 2:9 and 3:9.
 38 An allusion to Revelation 2:25 or 3:11. But if the Bible speaks of keeping
 the faith, then Catholic polemicists used it to prove the depravity of the
 Waldenses. The same applies to the image of the extinguished candle.
 39 “... comedebant et bibebant cum laetitia magna, incipiendo quando gentes
 de terra iverant ad dormitionem circa primum somnum et ultra, post bibitum
 et comestionem stinguebant lumina, dicentes: qui habet, teneat, et illic erant
 viri et mulieres proximo gradu sibi attinentes, et sic stabant usque circa
 auroram”. DÖLLINGER, 257-258.
 40 Dead as a complete opposite to eternal alive Christ.
 41 In his later sermon, Ademar wrote about many heresiarchs, who had such
 a powder made from bones of dead men (no mentions of children), which
 they covered under the guise of medicine for naive peasants; and nobody
 could resist it. CALLAHAN, 226.
 42 SACKVILLE, 59.
 43 “Item praedicant in locis occultis et privatis”. DÖLLINGER, 369.
 44 GUIDONIS, 250.
 45 MERLO 1977, 198.
 46 GONNET 1998, 14.
 47 GONNET 1998, 103.
 48 SACKVILLE, 20; BAIN, 59.
 49 “Quando autem primo accedunt ad homines simplices, quia astutos et
 litteratos fugiunt, dicunt se scire orationes optimas”. GONNET 1998, 103.
 50 SUERBAUM, 145.
 51 Means “Church prelates”.

- 52 "Let the negligence of the faithful teachers be shamed, who are not so zealous
for the truth of the Catholic faith, as the perfidious Lionist is zealous for the
error of unbelief". PATSCHOVSKY 1973, 71.
- 53 SACKVILLE, 33-36.
- 54 "... Waldenses suos doctores, qui tamen in suis erroribus et optionibus
tripartiti sunt, et per consequens ecclesiam non constituentes, cum ecclesia
ad Eph. 4 sit una similiter et fides". NEUMANN, 679.
- 55 TASCA 2008, 580.
- 56 WAGEMAKERS, 343.
- 57 PATSCHOVSKY 1973, 20-43.
- 58 ARNOLD 31.
- 59 "Recurrunt ad sophismata et duplicitates et fugas verborum ne deprehendantur
in suis erroribus". GUIDONIS, 255.
- 60 PATSCHOVSKY 1973, 71.
- 61 GONNET 1998, 162-163.
- 62 PATSCHOVSKY 1979, 179, 199, 233.
- 63 "Quando queretur a vobis, si veniunt homines a vos, qui audiunt confessiones
et faciunt predicationes, respondeatis: "Veniunt homines ad nos, qui
nobis [omitted by the editor], et portant alias res domesticas necessarias
mulieribus"". Et sic per hunc modum evaserunt ab incarceratione et officium
inquisitionis illuserunt, quia nullus ex eis fuit crematus". PATSCHOVSKY
1979, 199.
- 64 VÄLIMÄKI 2019, 224-225.
- 65 BUENO 248.
- 66 THOMPSON, 200.
- 67 SUERBAUM, 139.
- 68 SUERBAUM, 125-126.
- 69 UTZ TREMP 1996, 537.
- 70 For example, in the ninth chapter of the Bernard Gui's book (GUIDONIS,
256-257) or Peter Zwicker (one of the most effective inquisitor of the late
XIV century in the Central Europe). KURZE, 73-75.
- 71 "Is quadam die dominica cum declinasset ad turbam, quam ante ioculatorem
viderat congregatam, ex verbis ipsius conpungtus fuit, et eum ad domum
suam deducens, intente eum audire curavit. Fuit enim locus narrationis eius,
qualiter beatus Alexis in domo patris sui beato fine quievit". EX CHRONICO
UNIVERSALI ANONYMI LAUDUNENSIS, 447.
- 72 TASCA 2018, 185-186, 192-195, 199.
- 73 TASCA 2018, 192 note 36.
- 74 ROACH, 28.
- 75 "Iucundus, honestus, gravis, spectabilis, qui caelestium spectatorum
delectare possit aspectus". ZINK, 168.
- 76 ZINK, 174.

- 77 ZINK, 170.
 78 ZINK, 171.
 79 VÄLIMÄKI 2022, 35.
 80 "Et videtur eis, quod omnia tunc sint aurea, et apparet eis celum et thronus aureus et Lucifer in maiestate magna et angeli circumvolantes; et quamdiu ibi sunt servientes Lucifero." PATSCHOVSKY 1980, 164.
 81 GUIDONIS, 248.
 82 GONNET 1998, 160.
 83 OGÓREK, 178.
 84 SZYMAŃSKI, 37-47.
 85 OGÓREK, 102-104, 111-118.
 86 http://expositions.bnf.fr/flamands/grand/fla_212.htm
 87 "Et alius est demon quam adoravit in formam cati quam nominant Temon et eciam alias eundem adoravit in forma capre." PATRIA, 135 n. 36
 88 BRUNN, 345-347.
 89 "[...] tenebat buffonem grossum sub lecto, quem nutriebat cum carnibus et pane et caseo. Interrogatus, propter quod tenebat, respondit, ut de stercore ipsius faceret poculum praedictum sive beneficia supradicta." DÖLLINGER, 258.
 90 UTZ TREMP 2002, 117.
 91 MERCIER.
 92 <https://gallica.bnf.fr/ark:/12148/btv1b525033083/f216.image>
 93 BEHRINGER.
 94 WINGERD; OSOKIN, 410.
 95 PALOMBARO.
 96 CAMERON, 502.
 97 MERLO 1989, 49; VOLPE, 60.
 98 RUSSELL, 138.
 99 VOLODINA, 25.
 100 PALOMBARO 83.
 101 AUDISIO; BALOSSINO, 65; BYLINA, 108; MERLO 1977, 103-109; MOLNÁR, 121-133.
 102 ENGELS, 34.
 103 There was an Italian school started by Raffaello Morghen, Gioacchino Volpe, Cinzio Violante, and German Ernst Werner who fruitfully worked on this question.
 104 GIVEN, 222.
 105 REHR.
 106 REHR, 36-38.
 107 BENEDETTI 2015, 85.
 108 FEUCHTER; WOMEN PREACHERS; BENEDETTI 2015; MICK-EVANS; SHAHAR.

- ¹⁰⁹ WOMEN PREACHERS, 101.
- ¹¹⁰ GONNET 1958, 80-81, 100, 104, 155, 165; GONNET 1998, 141, 158, 209-210; PATSCHOVSKY 1973, 76; "BURCHARDI ET CUONRADI URSPERGENSIUM CHRONICON," 376.
- ¹¹¹ GONNET 1998, 158.
- ¹¹² GIVEN, 227.
- ¹¹³ PL 215:1513, 2016:29-30, 275, 601.
- ¹¹⁴ BUC, 45.
- ¹¹⁵ PATSCHOVSKY 1973, 63.
- ¹¹⁶ Homepage (facoltavaldese.org)
- ¹¹⁷ Pilar Jiménez Sanchez names this process "systematic dedramatisation". SANCHEZ, 19.

Bibliography

Abbreviation:

PL - Patrologia Latina.

- “BURCHARDI ET CUONRADI URSPERGENSIUM CHRONICON”, in *Monumenta Germaniae Historica. Scriptores* 23, 333–90. Ed. by O. Abel et L. Weiland, Hannover, Hahn, Hannoverae Impensis Bibliopolii Hahniani, 1974.
- “EX CHRONICO UNIVERSALI ANONYMI LAUDUNENSIS”, in *Monumenta Germaniae Historica. Scriptores* 26, 442–57. Ed. by G. Waitz, 1882.
- AKBARI, S.C. *Idols in the East: European Representations of Islam and the Orient, 1100-1450*, Cornell University Press, 2009.
- ARNOLD, J.H., “‘A Man Takes an Ox by the Horn and a Peasant by the Tongue’: Literacy, Orality and Inquisition in Medieval Languedoc”, in *Learning and Literacy in Medieval England and Abroad*, 2003, 31–47.
- AUDISIO, G. “La Montagne : un refuge pour les vaudois ?” In *Clergés, communautés et famille des montagnes d’Europe*, 2005, 237–42. <https://doi.org/10.4000/books.psorbonne.64184>
- BAIN, E., “Aux sources du discours antihérétique ? Exégèse et hérésie au XIIe siècle”, in *Aux marges de l’hérésie*, 2018, 53–83.
- BALOSSINO, S., and J. Chiffolleau. “Valdesi e mondo comunale in Provenza nel Duecento”, in *Valdesi medievali: bilanci e prospettive di ricerca*, 61–102. Ed. by G. Audisio and M. Benedetti, Torino, Claudiana, 2009.
- BEHRINGER, W., “How Waldensians Became Witches: Heretics and Their Journey to the Other World”, in *Communicating with the Spirits*, Budapest, New York, Central European University Press, 2005, pp. 155-192.
- BENEDETTI, M., “The Bible, Women Heretics, and Inquisitors”, in *The High Middle Ages*, 83–99. Ed. by Kari Elisabeth Børresen, Atlanta, SBL Press, 2015.
- BENEDETTI, M., and E. CAMERON, *A Companion to the Waldenses in the Middle Ages*, vol. 103, Brill’s Companions to the Christian Tradition, Leiden, Brill, 2022.
- BIGET, J.-L., S. Caucanas, M. Fournié, and D. Le Blévec, *Le «Catharisme» en questions*, vol. 55, Fanjeaux, Centre d’études historiques de Fanjeaux, 2020.
- BILLER, P., “Heresy and Literacy: Earlier History of the Theme”, in *Heresy and Literacy: 1000-1530*, 1–18. Ed.: P. Biller, A. Hudson, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 1996.
- BRUNN, U., *Des contestataires aux cathares : discours de réforme et propagande antihérétique dans les pays du Rhin et de la Meuse avant l’Inquisition*, Paris, Institut d’études augustiniennes, 2006.
- BUC, P., “‘Vox Clamantis in Deserto?’ Pierre Le Chantre et La Prédication Laïque”, in *Revue Mabillon*, 4, 1993, 5–47
- BUENO, I., *Defining Heresy: Inquisition, Theology, and Papal Policy in the Time of Jacques Fournier*, Leiden, Brill, 2015.

- BYLINA, S., "Heretycy w społeczeństwie: świadectwo czeskich źródeł inkwizycyjnych z XIV wieku", in *Kwartalnik Historyczny*. 86, no. 1, 1982, 105–17.
- CALLAHAN, D. F., "Heresy and the Antichrist in the Writings of Ademar of Chabannes", in *Where Heaven and Earth Meet: Essays on Medieval Europe in Honor of Daniel F. Callahan*, 178–226. Ed. by M. Frassetto and J. Hosler, Leiden, Brill, 2014.
- CAMERON, E., "From the Reformation to the Past", in *A Companion to the Waldenses in the Middle Ages* 103, 499–534, Brill's Companions to the Christian Tradition; Ed. by M. Benedetti and E. Cameron, Leiden, Brill, 2022.
- CLASSEN, A. (Ed.), *Meeting the Foreign in the Middle Ages*, New York, Routledge, 2002.
- DÖLLINGER, I. von. Beiträge zur Sektengeschichte des Mittelalters, München, Beck, 1890.
- FEUCHTER, J., "Waldenserinnen im Mittelalter", in *Zur Geistesgeschichte des Mittelalters und der frühen Neuzeit*, 47–68. Ed. by G. Frank and S. Lalla, Heidelberg, Verlag Regionalkultur, 2003.
- GIVEN, J. B., "A Medieval Inquisitor at Work: Bernard Gui, 3 March 1308 to 19 June 1323", in *Portraits of Medieval and Renaissance Living: Essays in Memory of David Herlihy*, 207–32. Ed. by S. Kline Cohn and S. Epstein, Ann Arbor, University of Michigan Press, 1996.
- GONNET, G., *Enchiridion fontium valdensium*, vol. 1: *Du IIIe Concile de Latran au Synode de Chanforan (1179–1532)*, Torre Pellice, Claudiana, 1958.
- GONNET, G., *Enchiridion fontium valdensium*, vol. 2: *De la fin du XIIIe au début du XIVe siècle*, Torino, Claudiana, 1998.
- GUIDONIS, B., *Practica inquisitionis haeretica pravitatis*, Publié Par C. Douais, Paris, Alphonse Picard, 1886.
- KIENZLE, B.M., "Holiness and Obedience: Denouncement of Twelfth-Century Waldensian Lay Preaching", in *The Devil, Heresy and Witchcraft in the Middle Ages: Essays in Honor of Jeffrey B. Russell*, 259–78. Ed. by A. Ferreiro, Leiden, Brill, 1998.
- KRAMER, S.R., *Sin, Interiority, and Selfhood in the Twelfth-Century West*. Studies and Texts, No. 200, Toronto, Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies, 2015.
- KURZE, D., *Quellen zur Ketzergeschichte Brandenburgs und Pommerns*, Berlin, NY, de Gruyter, 1975.
- LOBRICHON, G., "The Chiaroscuro of Heresy: Early Eleventh-Century Aquitaine as Seen from Auxerre", in *The Peace of God: Social Violence and Religious Response in France around the Year 1000*, 80–103. Ed. by T. Head and R. Landes, Ithaca, NY, Cornell University Press, 1992.
- LOCKETT, L., *Anglo-saxon psychologies in the vernacular and Latin traditions*, University of Toronto Press, 2011.
- MANSELLI, R., *Una "Summa auctoritatum" antieretica: (Ms. 47 della Bibliothéque municipale di Albi)*, Accademia Nazionale dei Lincei, Roma, 1985.

- MERCIER, F., and M. Ostorero. "The 'Waldensian Sect': Heresy and Witchcraft", in *A Companion to the Waldenses in the Middle Ages* 103, 395–421. Brill's Companions to the Christian Tradition; Ed. by Marina Benedetti and Euan Cameron, Leiden, Brill, 2022.
- MERLO, G.G., "Distribuzione topografica e composizione sociale delle comunità valdesi in Piemonte nel basso Medioevo", in *Bollettino della Società di Studi Valdesi* 95, 1974, 1–30.
- MERLO, G.G., *Eretici e inquisitori nella società piemontese del Trecento*, Torino, Claudiana, 1977.
- MERLO, G.G., *Eretici ed eresie medievali*, Bologna, Il Mulino, 1989.
- MERLO, G.G., *Inquisitori e inquisizione del Medioevo*, Bologna, Il mulino, 2008.
- MICK-EVANS, K.M., "A Bastion of Feminine Equality? Women's Roles in the Waldensian Movement," 2014. https://www.academia.edu/12235874/A_Bastion_of_Feminine_Equality_Womens_Roles_in_the_Waldensian_Movement.
- MOLNÁR, A., *Storia dei valdesi*, vol. 1: Dalle origini all'adesione alla Riforma, Torino, Claudiana, 1989.
- MUSOLFF, A., "The study of metaphor as part of critical discourse analysis", in *Critical Discourse Studies*, 2012, 9:3, 301–310.
- NEUMANN, A., "Nové doklady k dějinám Valdenských v Čechách", in *Čas. pro katolické Duchovenstvo*, 1925, No. 9/10, 674–681.
- OGÓREK, M., *Beginiki I waldensi na śląsku I Morawach do Końca XIV Wieku*, Racibórz, Wydawn. i Agencja Wydawn. WAW Grzegorz Wawoczny, 2012.
- PALOMBARO, O., "Reality and Representations of the Doctrine of Justification in Early Waldensian Preaching", in *Medieval Sermon Studies* 64, no. 1, 2020, 77–84.
- PATRIA, L., "«Sicut canis reddiens ad vomitum»: lo spaesamento dei valdesi nel balivato sabauda della diocesi di Torino fra Tre e Quattrocento", in *Valdesi medievali: bilanci e prospettive di ricerca*, 121–61. Ed. by G. Audisio and M. Benedetti, Torino, Claudiana, 2009.
- PATSCHOVSKY, A., "Waldenserfolgung in Schweidnitz 1315", in *Deutsches Archiv für die Erforschung des Mittelalters* 36, 1980, 137–76.
- PATSCHOVSKY, A., and K.-V. Selge, *Quellen zur Geschichte der Waldenser*, Gütersloh, Gütersloher Verlagshaus Mohn, 1973.
- PATSCHOVSKY, A., *Quellen Zur Bohmischen Inquisition Im 14. Jahrhundert*, Weimar, Hermann Böhlau Nachfolger, 1979.
- PEGG, M.G., *The Paradigm of Catharism; or, the Historians' Illusion*, in *Cathars in Question* 21-52, Boydell & Brewer, 2016.
- REGIEWICZ, A., *Wizerunek heretyka w średniowiecznym piśmiennictwie polskim*, Katowice, Biblioteka Śląska, 2002.

- REHR, J-P., "Re-Mapping the 'Great Inquisition' of 1245–46: The Case of Mas-Saintes-Puelles and Saint-Martin-Lalande", in *Open Library of Humanities* 5, no. 1, 2019, 1–52.
- ROACH, A.P., *The Devil's World: Heresy and Society 1100-1300*, Routledge, 2019.
- RUBELLIN, M., "Au temps où Valdès n'était pas hérétique : hypothèse sur le rôle de Valdès à Lyon (1170-1183)." *Église et société chrétienne d'Agobard à Valdès*, 2003, 455–78.
- RUSSELL, J.B., and D.W. Lumsden, *A History of Medieval Christianity: Prophecy and Order*, New York, Peter Lang, 2000.
- SACKVILLE, L.J., "The Textbook Heretic: Moneta of Cremona's Cathars", in *Cathars in Question*, 208–28. Ed. by A. Sennis. Woodbridge, Suffolk, UK: York Medieval Press, 2018.
- SANCHEZ, Pilar Jiménez. "Aux commencements du Catharisme : La communauté d'apôtres hérétiques' dénoncée par Evervin de Steinfeld en Rhénanie." *Heresis*. 35 (2001): 17–44.
- SHAHAR, S., *Women in a Medieval Heretical Sect: Agnes and Huguette the Waldensians*, Woodbridge, Boydell & Brewer, 2001.
- SUERBAUM, A., "Language of Violence: Language as Violence in Vernacular Sermons", in *Polemic: Language as Violence in Medieval and Early Modern Discourse*, 125–48. Ed. by A. Suerbaum, G. Southcombe and B. Thompson, Routledge, 2016.
- SZPIECH, R., *Conversion and Narrative: Reading and religious authority in medieval polemic*, Philadelphia, University of Pennsylvania Press, 2013.
- SZWAT-GYŁYBOWA, G., *Haeresis bulgarica w bułgarskiej świadomości kulturowej XIX i XX wieku*, Warszawa, Slawistyczny Ośrodek Wydawniczy, 2005.
- SZYMAŃSKI, J., *Ruchy heretyckie na Śląsku w XIII i XIV wieku*, Katowice; Kraków, Fund. "Zamek Chudów"; Inst. Książki, 2007.
- TASCA, F., "I barba valdesi. predicatori nella notte tra medioevo e riforma", in *Rivista di storia della chiesa in Italia*, vol. 62, no. 2, 2008, 577–82.
- TASCA, F., "La prima predicazione di Valdo? Riflessioni sul «Chronicon Universale» di Laon", in *Predicazione e repressione. Processi e letteratura religiosa*, 181–201. A cura di A. Giraudo e M. Rivoira, Torino, Claudiana, 2018.
- THOMPSON, B., "The Polemic of Reform in the Later Medieval English Church", in *Polemic: Language as Violence in Medieval and Early Modern Discourse*, 183–222. Ed. by A. Suerbaum, G. Southcombe and B. Thompson, Routledge, 2016.
- UTZ TREMP, K., "'Parmi les hérétiques...': la Vierge Marie dans le registre d'inquisition de l'évêque Jacques Fournier de Pamiers (1317-1326)", in *Marie. Le culte de la Vierge dans la société médiévale*, 533–60. Ed. by D. Iogna-Prat, É. Palazzo and D. Russo, Paris, Beauchesne, 1996.

- UTZ TREMP, K., "Von der Häresie zur Hexerei. Waldenser- und Hexenverfolgungen im Heutigen Kanton Freiburg (1399-1442)", in *Schweizerische Zeitschrift für Geschichte* 52, 2002, 115-121.
- VÄLIMÄKI, R., "Chapter 1 The Worst of All Heresies: Polemical Responses to Waldensianism Ca. 1200 – 1400", in *Encountering Others, Understanding Ourselves in Medieval and Early Modern Thought*, 21–40. Ed. by N. Faucher and V. Mäkinen, Berlin, Boston, De Gruyter Oldenbourg, 2022.
- VÄLIMÄKI, R., "Imagery of Disease, Poison and Healing in the Late Fourteenth-Century Polemics against Waldensian Heresy", in *Infirmity in Antiquity and the Middle Ages: Social and Cultural Approaches to Health, Weakness and Care*, 137–52. Ed. by C. Krötzel, K Mustakallio and J. Kuuliala, London, Routledge, Taylor & Francis Group, 2016.
- VÄLIMÄKI, R., *Heresy in Late Medieval Germany: The Inquisitor Petrus Zwicker and the Waldensians*, Woodbridge, Suffolk, UK, A York Medieval Press publication in association with the Boydell Press, 2019.
- VOLODINA, A.V., "Communities of "paupers catholici" and "paupers reconciled" within the framework of the religious rise of the second half of the 11th – the first half of the 13th century", in *Bractwa religijne w średniowieczu iw okresie nowożytnym (to end of XVIII wieku)*, 19–31. Ed. by D. Burdzy, B. Wojciechowska. Kielce, 2014.
- VOLPE, G., *Movimenti religiosi e sette ereticali nella società medievale italiana (secoli XI-XIV)*, Roma, Donzelli Editore, 1997.
- WAGEMAKERS, B., "Incest, Infanticide, and Cannibalism: Anti-Christian Imputations in the Roman Empire", in *Greece & Rome* 57, no. 2, 2010, 337–54. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/40929483>.
- WINGERD, J., "«Poor Preaching Protestants»: a Brief Discussion of the Waldenses." Accessed 22.10.2022. https://www.academia.edu/11593267/Poor_Preaching_Protestants.
- WOMEN PREACHERS and Prophets through Two Millennia of Christianity, 99–113. Ed. by B.M. Kienzle and P.J. Walker, Berkeley, University of California Press, 1998.
- ZINK, M., *Poésie et conversion au Moyen Âge*, Paris, Presses Univ. de France, 2003.
- ОСОКИН, Н.А., История альбигойцев и их времени, [Москва, Изд-во «АСТ», 2000. [OSOKIN, N. *History of the Albigensians and their time*. Moscow, Nazran: AST, 2000]
- ЭНГЕЛЬС, Ф., Крестьянская война в Германии, Москва, Госполитиздат, 1952. [ENGELS, F. *Peasant war in Germany*, Moscow, Gospolitizdat, 1952]